

FOI Request Reference: DCYA 2018/104

Schedule of Records for FOI 2018/104: Summary of Decision Making

Rec. No.	No. of pages	Date of Record	Brief Description	Decision: Grant/Part Grant/Refuse
1	4	19/08/2018-20/08/2018	Thread of emails between Minister Zappone & Special Advisors	Grant
2	1	21/08/2018	Email to Minister Zappone from Patricia Ryan, Special Advisor	Grant
3	1	21/08/2018	Attachment to Record 2 – Draft Letter	Grant
4	1	21/08/2018	Email to Minister Zappone from Jerry O'Connor, Special Advisor	Grant
5	2	21/08/2018	Attachment to Record 4 – Draft Letter	Grant
6	1	21/08/2018	Email from Minister Zappone to Special Advisors	Grant

1



Re: Pope
Katherine Zappone to: Jerry O'Connor
Cc: patricia ryan2

20/08/2018 12:21

Good. Ok. Will you review words PR put together? And, see if you think any amendments to make it more straightforward but with same messages.

Meanwhile, I will look at op ed now.

Thanks K

Dr. Katherine Zappone, TD
Independent
Minister for Children and Youth Affairs
Sent from my iPad

On 20 Aug 2018, at 11:56, Jerry O'Connor [REDACTED] wrote:

Hi,

Certainly I think going directly to the Pope is the way to go and is certainly noteworthy in and of itself.

Given the opportunity is so short (max 30 seconds?) introducing the topic, setting out 'The church needs to step up to the plate' in a better form of words and asking for a channel of communication is perhaps about as far as you could go....

To have the door-opened - whether it ends being through a Cardinal, the Archbishop or Nuncio - would be a big success and allow for further more detailed engagement. It is the best possible outcome we could hope for from this very short engagement.

Regards

Jerry

Katherine Zappone---20/08/2018 11:06:10---Addendum - to discuss 'share in costs to excavate and re-bury with dignity'

From: Katherine Zappone/SLAINTE
To: patricia ryan2 [REDACTED]
Cc: Jerry O'Connor [REDACTED]
Date: 20/08/2018 11:06
Subject: Re: Pope

Jerry ?

Dr. Katherine Zappone, TD
Independent

Minister for Children and Youth Affairs

Sent from my iPad

On 20 Aug 2018, at 10:57, patricia ryan2 [REDACTED] wrote:

Just my opinion and not in any way wedded to this.

I think we need to focus on the Pope. If there are issues with the Dublin Archbishop - then the Pope is his "boss". We are going to the top. I think there is nothing to lose by asking him a direct question - he may or may not offer a response. Even raising it with him is meaningful. It will, no doubt be the first time that it has been raised with him.

Katherine Zappone---20/08/2018 10:41:48---Addendum - to discuss 'share in costs to excavate and re-bury with dignity'

From: Katherine Zappone/SLAINTE
To: patricia ryan2 [REDACTED]
Cc: Jerry O'Connor [REDACTED]
Date: 20/08/2018 10:41
Subject: Re: Pope

Ok. Let us not be overly specific. I like very much what is here.

Question:

Is it practical to ask him for a direct response? Will that get us what we want? What is role of Dublin Archbishop? Or, are we looking to make a more symbolic statement/

Dr. Katherine Zappone, TD
Independent
Minister for Children and Youth Affairs

Sent from my iPad

On 20 Aug 2018, at 10:35, patricia ryan2 [REDACTED]

> wrote:

Ok. My suggestion is that we are not overly specific. I think the key message is that the Church needs to step up to the plate. Looking for a commitment on a course of action that has not yet been sanctioned by government will be risky. Also, I think you need to leave yourself room for manoeuvre. This does not in any way preclude you from giving a strong message and one that can easily be expanded on following the government decision by writing to the Pope as a follow-up.

Enjoy the match.

J

Sent from IBM Notes Traveler

Katherine Zappone --- Pope ---

From: "Katherine Zappone" [REDACTED]

To: "patricia ryan2" [REDACTED]

"Jerry O'Connor" [REDACTED]

Date: Sun, 19 Aug 2018 9:34 AM

Subject: Pope

Addendum - to discuss 'share in costs to excavate and re-bury with dignity'

That puts out part of my preferred recommendation.

K

Dr. Katherine Zappone, TD
Independent
Minister for Children and Youth Affairs

Sent from my iPad

2



Draft 1 - Pope Francis letter

patricia ryan2 to: Katherine Zappone, Jerry O'Connor

21/08/2018 16:23



Dear Pope Francis - Draft 1.docx

Please update the draft number per changes.

Dear Pope Francis,

Mother and Baby Homes came to public attention in the summer of 2014 following a series of disturbing reports of high mortality rates and claims of possible burials of children on the grounds of the former Mother and Baby Home in Tuam Co. Galway. The then Government decided to have these matters investigated and a statutory Commission of Investigation was established in February 2015.

Since that date, the Commission has been examining a wide range of concerns related to the institutional care of unmarried mothers and their babies during the period 1922 to 1998. The Commission is examining 14 Mother and Baby Homes and 4 County Homes. It will in time provide a full account of what happened to vulnerable women and children in these institutions; how they came to be there; and the pathways they took as they left.

An early focus of the Commission's work was to examine the Tuam site to address questions about the alleged interment of human remains. As part of this process, the Commission conducted a series of surveys and test excavations, commencing in October 2016. I visited the site myself and met former residents and relatives shortly before these works commenced.

The statutory Commission of Investigation confirmed the presence of human remains on the site of the former Bon Secours Mother and Baby Home in Tuam, Co. Galway. The Home was run by the Bon Secours Sisters from 1925-1961 in what was previously a workhouse dating back to famine times. In the 1970's the former home was demolished to make way for a local authority housing estate. A small memorial garden is maintained by local residents and there is also a children's playground on the site.

The Commission's excavations have revealed that human remains are visible in a series of chambers that may have formed part of sewage treatment works for the Home. The Commission believes that there are a significant number of children's remains there. It recovered some juvenile remains for detailed forensic analysis. From this analysis, it has determined that the remains are between 35 foetal weeks and 2 to 3 years of age. From carbon dating it has correlated the age of these samples with the time period during which the home was in operation – between 1925 and 1961.

This news was met with widespread disgust both in Ireland and abroad. There were suspicions about burials of this kind in Tuam for some time, and it was one of the reasons for setting up the Commission of Investigation in the first place. However, it is fair to say that the confirmation received from the Commission of Investigation caused many people to demand that dignity and respect be afforded to the memory of the children who lived their short lives in this Home. We also owe it to the families of these children to now do the right thing by their loved ones.

The Commission has already notified the local coroner in north Galway of its findings, and Galway County Council is aware of the matter also. We have now put in place a series of actions to ensure that we have an appropriate and respectful response to the discovery.

Since then, I have instructed an expert team to do further work on the site to determine the options that are open to us to fulfil our duty to these children. The team has reported offering options including a complete excavation of the site and DNA analysis of the hundreds of remains contained therein.

A consultation has also been carried out with survivors and local residents about what they would like to see happen on the site in Tuam.

There was little compassion shown to the little ones and their mothers in this mother and baby home.

We cannot change what happened to them. For the little ones whose remains are in a sewage system, we owe them dignity in death. For their mothers, siblings and families we need to give them some peace.


It is my strong conviction that given the role of the Church in this shameful chapter of recent Irish history it must play a practical role in addressing the hurt and damage. I believe that the church should contribute substantially to the cost of whatever option is decided by the government. This should be done willingly, unconditionally and quickly. Nothing less will demonstrate remorse.

I look forward to receiving your response,

Yours etc.

4



Draft 2 - Pope Francis letter 
Jerry O'Connor to: patricia ryan2
Cc: Katherine Zappone

21/08/2018 16:40

History: This message has been replied to.

Hi,

Just some minor changes, the introduction and sign off of the letter are as recommended for a non-Catholic when writing to the Pope.

Regards

J



Dear Pope Francis - Draft 2.docx

patricia ryan2	Please update the draft number per changes.	21/08/2018 16:23:14
----------------	---	---------------------

From: patricia ryan2 [REDACTED]
To: Katherine Zappone [REDACTED], Jerry O'Connor [REDACTED]
Date: 21/08/2018 16:23
Subject: Draft 1 - Pope Francis letter

[attachment "Dear Pope Francis - Draft 1.docx" deleted by Jerry O'Connor/SLAINTE]

Please update the draft number per changes.

Dear Pope Francis,

Your Holiness (or alternatively, Most Holy Father)

Formatted: Font: (Default) +Body (Calibri), 12 pt

As Minister for Children and Youth Affairs and an Independent Minister of the Government of Ireland I am writing to you in the hope that the church will accept its responsibilities and make reparation for its part in a very shameful chapter of Irish history.

Mother and Baby Homes came to public attention in Ireland during the summer of 2014 following a series of disturbing reports of high mortality rates and claims of possible burials of children on the grounds of the former Mother and Baby Home in Tuam Co. Galway. The then Government decided to have these matters investigated and a statutory Commission of Investigation was established in February 2015.

Since that date, the Commission has been examining a wide range of concerns related to the institutional care of unmarried mothers and their babies during the period 1922 to 1998. The Commission is examining 14 Mother and Baby Homes and 4 County Homes. It will in time provide a full account of what happened to vulnerable women and children in these institutions; how they came to be there; and the pathways they took as they left.

An early focus of the Commission's work was to examine the Tuam site to address questions about the alleged interment of human remains. As part of this process, the Commission conducted a series of surveys and test excavations, commencing in October 2016. I visited the site myself and met former residents and relatives shortly before these works commenced.

The statutory Commission of Investigation confirmed the presence of human remains on the site of the former Bon Secours Mother and Baby Home in Tuam, Co. Galway. The Home was run by the Bon Secours Sisters from 1925-1961 in what was previously a workhouse dating back to famine times. In the 1970's the former home was demolished to make way for a local authority housing estate. A small memorial garden is maintained by local residents and there is also a children's playground on the site.

The Commission's excavations have revealed that human remains are visible in a series of chambers that may have formed part of sewage treatment works for the Home. The Commission believes that there are a significant number of children's remains there. It recovered some juvenile remains for detailed forensic analysis. From this analysis, it has determined that the remains are between 35 foetal weeks and 2 to 3 years of age. From carbon dating it has correlated the age of these samples with the time period during which the home was in operation – between 1925 and 1961.

This news was met with widespread disgust both in Ireland and abroad. There were suspicions about burials of this kind in Tuam for some time, and it was one of the reasons for setting up the Commission of Investigation in the first place. However, it is fair to say that the confirmation received from the Commission of Investigation caused many people to demand that dignity and respect be afforded to the memory of the children who lived their short lives in this Home. We also owe it to the families of these children to now do the right thing by their loved ones.

The Commission has already notified the local coroner in north Galway of its findings, and Galway County Council is aware of the matter also. We have now put in place a series of actions to ensure that we have an appropriate and respectful response to the discovery.

Since then, I have instructed an expert team to do further work on the site to determine the options that are open to us to fulfil our duty to these children. The team has reported offering options including a complete excavation of the site and DNA analysis of the hundreds of remains contained therein.

A consultation has also been carried out with survivors and local residents about what they would like to see happen on the site in Tuam.

Formatted: Font: (Default) +Body (Calibri), 12 pt, Bold, Font color: Black

There was little compassion shown to the little ones and their mothers in this mother-and-baby home.

Formatted: Font: (Default) +Body (Calibri), 12 pt

We cannot change what happened to them. For the little ones whose remains are in a sewage system, we owe them dignity in death. For their mothers, siblings and families we need to give them some peace.

It is my strong conviction that given the role of the Church in this shameful chapter of recent Irish history it must play a practical role in addressing the hurt and damage. I believe that the church should contribute substantially to the cost of whatever option is decided by the government. This should be done willingly, unconditionally and quickly. Nothing less will demonstrate remorse.

I look forward to receiving your response.

With every best wish, sincerely yours,

Dr Katherine Zappone

Minister for Children and Youth Affairs

Yours etc.



Re: Draft 2 - Pope Francis letter
Katherine Zappone to: Jerry O'Connor
Cc: patricia ryan2

21/08/2018 16:45

May I sleep on this?
I prefer dear pope Francis

Sent from my iPhone

On 21 Aug 2018, at 16:40, Jerry O'Connor [REDACTED] wrote:

Hi,

Just some minor changes, the introduction and sign off of the letter are as recommended for a non-Catholic when writing to the Pope.

Regards

J

(See attached file: Dear Pope Francis - Draft 2.docx)

patricia ryan2---21/08/2018 16:23:14---Please update the draft number per changes.

From: patricia ryan2 [REDACTED]
To: Katherine Zappone [REDACTED], Jerry O'Connor [REDACTED]
Date: 21/08/2018 16:23
Subject: Draft 1 - Pope Francis letter

[attachment "Dear Pope Francis - Draft 1.docx" deleted by Jerry O'Conno [REDACTED]]

Please update the draft number per changes.
<Dear Pope Francis - Draft 2.docx>